UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

TABLE OF CONTENTS

COVER i
APPROVAL SHEET ii
STATEMENT OF ACADEMIC INTEGRITY iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS vi
LIST OF FIGURES xii
LIST OF TABLES xiii
ABSTRACT xiv
INTISARI xv
CHAPTER 1
INTRODUCTION 1
A. Research Background 1
B. Research Questions 12
C. Literature Review 12
D. Theoretical Framework 24
1. Value and Action in the Study 25
2. Adapting the Value–Action Gap to Religious Organizations 27
3. Translating Blake's Barriers into Institutional Terms 29
4. Ethical Negotiation 33
5. Analytical Model 34
E. Research Method 37
1. Research Design and Scope 37
2. Data Corpus 38
3. Data Selection and Organization 42
4. Critical Discourse Analysis 43
5. Integration of CDA and the Value–Action Gap 49
6. Research Scope 50

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

CHAPTER 2

RELIGION, ENVIRONMENTAL VALUES, AND MINING GOVERNANCE 52

A. Global Environmental Crisis and Religious Responses 52

B. Islamic Environmental Ethics: Human Responsibility toward the Earth ..62

1. *Tawhid*, *Khalifah*, and *Amanah* 63

2. *Mizan*, *Fasad*, and *Israf* 66

3. *Maslahah*, *Mafsadah*, and Harm Prevention.....69

4. Environmental Justice and Collective Responsibility.....71

C. PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah's Long-standing Environmental Values ..75

1. PBNU's Institutional Environmental Tradition.....76

2. PP Muhammadiyah's Institutional Environmental Tradition.....82

3. Shared Values and Institutional Differences 87

D. Defining Environmental Harm, Public Benefit, and the Representation of Nature 90

E. The Mining Controversy and Religious Authority in Indonesia.....98

CHAPTER 3

MAPPING THE DISCURSIVE LANDSCAPE OF PBNU AND PP MUHAMMADIYAH ON MINING GOVERNANCE 107

A. Introduction 107

B. Overview of the Data Corpus.....108

C. Primary Data: PBNU's Official Discourse on Mining Concessions.....110

1. Responsibility and Institutional Readiness 111

2. Organizational Need and Public Welfare 112

3. Affirmative Policy and Resource Redistribution 114

4. Environmental Conditions and Mining Governance.....116

D. Primary Data: PP Muhammadiyah's Official Discourse on Mining Concessions 118

1. Deliberation and Organizational Mandate 119

2. Theological and Legal Permissibility.....121

3. Public Welfare and Economic *Da'wah* 123

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

4. Professional Expertise and Environmental Safeguards.....124
5. Conditional Evaluation and the Possibility of Returning the Permit ...126
E. Secondary Data: Internal and External Responses to PBNU's Position ..128
1. Fiqh, Conditional Permissibility, and the Affirmative-Policy Argument 128
2. Transparency, Legal Control, and State Responsibility 131
3. Environmental Criticism and the Contestation of Maslahah 133
4. Plurality within the NU Discursive Field.....135
F. Secondary Data: Internal and External Responses to PP Muhammadiyah's Position.....136
1. Tarjih Reasoning and the Just Energy Transition.....137
2. Structural Dependence and Institutional Deliberation 139
3. Responsible Mining, Environmental Justice, and Institutional Capacity 141
4. External Criticism and Responses from Muhammadiyah Members....143
5. Plurality within the Muhammadiyah Discursive Field 146
G. Emerging Discursive Themes 147
H. Conclusion 149
CHAPTER 4
RELIGIOUS ENVIRONMENTAL VALUES, MINING GOVERNANCE, AND THE VALUE–ACTION GAP.....152
A. Introduction.....152
B. Textual Analysis: The Construction of Ethical Vocabulary 156
1. PBNU: Responsibility, Capacity, and Institutional Necessity 156
2. Rewording Mining as Public Benefit.....157
3. The Modality of Need 159
4. Extraction as Economic Necessity 160
5. Lexical Asymmetry in PBNU's Discourse.....161
6. PP Muhammadiyah: Deliberation and Procedural Legitimacy.....161
7. Nature as *Anugerah Allah* 163
8. Reclassifying Mining as Muamalah.....164

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

9. *Manfaat*, *Mafsadah*, and Reversible Acceptance 164
10. Positive Evaluation: Role Model, Not for Profit, and Environmentally Friendly Mining 165
11. Lexical Presence, Absence, and Agency 166
12. Comparative Textual Construction 167

C. Discursive Practice: Production, Circulation, and Contestation 168
1. PBNU's Leader-Centred Production 168
2. Internal Clarification and Audience Management 169
3. Secondary Fiqh Discourse 170
4. PBNU's Intertextual Network 171
5. Contestation of PBNU's Meaning of Maslahah 172
6. PP Muhammadiyah's Formal Production Process 173
7. Procedural Authority and the Claim of Independence 173
8. Muhammadiyah's Intertextuality and Interdiscursivity 174
9. The *Tarjih Fatwa* as Support and Tension 175
10. Media Recontextualization and Public Reception 176
11. Audience and Legitimizing Strategies 177
12. Discursive Practice as Legitimacy Management 177

D. Sociocultural and Structural Factors 178
1. State Policy as a Political Opportunity Structure 178
2. Affirmative Policy and Resource Redistribution 180
3. Relations with the State and Reciprocal Legitimacy 181
4. Organizational Scale and Economic Sustainability 182
5. Extractive Political Economy and Developmentalism 183
6. Representation of Nature 184
7. Confidence in Professional Governance 185
8. Regulatory Weakness and Diffusion of Responsibility 186
9. Distributional and Temporal Asymmetry 187
10. Moral Reputation and Religious Authority 188
11. Internal Plurality and Centralized Action 189
12. Interrelation of Structural Factors 190

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

E. Islamic Ethical Negotiation 191
1. Legal Permissibility and Ethical Legitimacy 191
2. Maslahah beyond Institutional Revenue 192
3. Mafsadah and Harm Prevention 193
4. The Lesser-Harm Principle 194
5. Khalifah and Amanah 195
6. State Policy and Islamic Public Ethics 196
7. Different Institutional Forms of Islamic Reasoning 196
8. Islamic Ethics as Justification and Critique 197
F. The Institutional Value–Action Gap 198
1. Value and Action at the Institutional Level 198
2. Mediation rather than Simple Contradiction 199
3. PBNU and Institutional Practicality 199
4. PBNU and Distributed Responsibility 200
5. PBNU's Institutional Identity and Competing Values 201
6. Muhammadiyah and Perceived Institutional Control 201
7. Conditional Acceptance as a Bridge 202
8. The Temporal Structure of the Gap 203
9. The Gap as Discursive Negotiation 203
10. Two Layers of Institutional Gap 204
11. Intention and Verifiable Mechanism 204
12. VAG and Internal Plurality 205
13. Institutional Interpretation 205
G. Comparative Findings 206
1. Shared Ethical Starting Point 206
2. PBNU: Service-Oriented Pragmatism 207
3. Muhammadiyah: Procedurally Controlled Participation 207
4. Different Constructions of Maslahah and Mafsadah 208
5. Different Forms of Religious Authority 210
6. Necessity and Conditionality 210
7. Shared Managerial Environmentalism 211

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

8. Comparison with Zahro....212
9. Central Comparative Finding....213
H. Conclusion....215
CHAPTER 5
CONCLUSION AND IMPLICATION....218
A. Answers to the Research Questions....218
B. Central Finding: Negotiated Environmental Ethics....223
C. Theoretical Contribution....225
D. Empirical Contribution....228
E. Implications and Recommendations for Faith-Based Organizations....229
1. Conduct an Independent Benefit–Harm Assessment before Accepting a Project....230
2. Establish Clear Thresholds, Monitoring, and an Exit Mechanism....231
3. Separate Legal Permissibility from Project-Level Ethical Approval...233
F. Research Limitations....234
G. Suggestions for Future Research....236
H. Final Reflection....238
BIBLIOGRAPHY....239
Library References....239
Online References....244