UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

ABSTRACT

Indonesia's 2024 policy granting religious organizations priority access to mining concessions generated debate over the relationship between religious environmental ethics and institutional economic action. This thesis examines how the long-standing environmental values of Pengurus Besar Nahdlatul Ulama (PBNU) and Pimpinan Pusat Muhammadiyah (PP Muhammadiyah) coexist with their decisions to participate in mining governance, how those decisions are discursively justified, and what factors mediate the resulting Value–Action Gap.

The study employs a qualitative comparative case-study design, combining Fairclough's three-dimensional Critical Discourse Analysis with an institutional adaptation of the Value–Action Gap framework. It analyses 32 texts and documents—11 primary and 21 secondary sources—supported by historical organizational materials. The analysis concerns institutional acceptance and justification rather than completed mining performance.

The findings show that both organizations had articulated environmental values concerning stewardship, responsibility, justice, ecological balance, public welfare, and harm prevention before the mining controversy. PBNU negotiates participation through service-oriented pragmatism, emphasizing *khidmah*, organizational sustainability, resource redistribution, and contextual *fiqh*. PP Muhammadiyah adopts procedurally controlled participation, emphasizing deliberation, conditional permissibility, professional expertise, monitoring, and possible withdrawal. Despite these differences, both converge upon managerial environmentalism: the belief that professional and religious governance can make mining sufficiently responsible.

The institutional gap is shaped by state policy, organizational responsibilities, extractive political economy, distributed accountability, and confidence in professional control.

The thesis concludes that environmental ethics is not abandoned but negotiated, reprioritized, and partially subordinated to political, economic, and institutional considerations.

Keywords: PBNU; PP Muhammadiyah; Mining Governance; Environmental Ethics; Value–Action Gap; Critical Discourse Analysis

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Faith and the Earth: Ethical Negotiation of PBNU and PP Muhammadiyah in Indonesiaâ€™s Mining Governance
Amyaz Bill Aufaq, Dr. Mohammad Iqbal Ahnaf; Dr. Leonard Chrysostomos Epafras
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

INTISARI

Kebijakan pemerintah Indonesia pada 2024 yang memberikan prioritas akses konsesi pertambangan kepada organisasi keagamaan memunculkan perdebatan mengenai hubungan antara etika lingkungan keagamaan dan tindakan ekonomi institusional. Tesis ini mengkaji bagaimana nilai-nilai lingkungan yang telah lama dimiliki Pengurus Besar Nahdlatul Ulama (PBNU) dan Pimpinan Pusat Muhammadiyah (PP Muhammadiyah) berdampingan dengan keputusan mereka untuk berpartisipasi dalam tata kelola pertambangan, bagaimana keputusan tersebut dibenarkan secara diskursif, serta faktor-faktor yang memediasi kesenjangan nilai–tindakan yang muncul.

Penelitian ini menggunakan desain studi kasus komparatif kualitatif dengan menggabungkan Analisis Wacana Kritis tiga dimensi Fairclough dan adaptasi institusional kerangka *Value–Action Gap*. Data penelitian terdiri atas 32 teks dan dokumen—11 sumber primer dan 21 sumber sekunder—yang didukung oleh bahan historis organisasi. Analisis berfokus pada penerimaan dan justifikasi institusional, bukan pada kinerja pertambangan yang telah selesai.

Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa sebelum kontroversi pertambangan, kedua organisasi telah mengartikulasikan nilai-nilai mengenai tanggung jawab, amanah pengelolaan, keadilan, keseimbangan ekologis, kemaslahatan publik, dan pencegahan bahaya. PBNU menegosiasikan partisipasi melalui pragmatisme berorientasi pelayanan yang menekankan *khidmah*, keberlanjutan organisasi, redistribusi sumber daya, dan *fiqh* kontekstual. PP Muhammadiyah menggunakan partisipasi yang dikendalikan secara prosedural melalui musyawarah, kebolehan bersyarat, keahlian profesional, pemantauan, dan kemungkinan pengembalian izin.

Meskipun berbeda, keduanya bertemu dalam environmentalisme manajerial, yaitu keyakinan bahwa tata kelola keagamaan dan profesional dapat membuat pertambangan cukup bertanggung jawab.

Tesis ini menyimpulkan bahwa etika lingkungan tidak ditinggalkan, tetapi dinegosiasikan, diprioritaskan ulang, dan sebagian disubordinasikan oleh pertimbangan politik, ekonomi, dan kelembagaan.

Kata kunci: PBNU; PP Muhammadiyah; Tata Kelola Pertambangan; Etika Lingkungan; *Value–Action Gap*; Analisis Wacana Kritis