UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

DAFTAR PUSTAKA

Amanulloh, Naeni, (2015), *Demokratisasi Desa*, Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi Republik Indonesia, Jakarta

Asenbaum, H (2022). Beyond deliberative systems: Pluralizing the debate. *Democratic Theory*, berghahnjournals.com, https://www.berghahnjournals.com/view/journals/democratic-theory/9/1/dt090106.xml

Avritzer, L (2009). *Democracy and the public space in Latin America*., degruyter.com, https://doi.org/10.1515/9781400825011

Avritzer, L (2016). Reflections on how to empirically ground the deliberative system's theory. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2016.1214077

Bächtiger, A, Dryzek, JS, Mansbridge, J, & Warren, ME (2018). *The Oxford handbook of deliberative democracy*, United Kingdom, Oxford University Press

Barnes, M (2008). Passionate participation: Emotional experiences and expressions in deliberative forums. *Critical social policy*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0261018308095280

Bhaskar, R (2000). Introducing transcendental dialectical critical realism. *Alethia*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1558/aleth.v3i1.15

Berg, M., & Lidskog, R. (2018). Deliberative democracy meets democratised science: a deliberative systems approach to global environmental governance. *Environmental Politics*, 27, 1 - 20. https://doi.org/10.1080/09644016.2017.1371919

Bernstein, S. (2011). Legitimacy in intergovernmental and non-state global governance. *Review of International Political Economy, 18*, 17 - 51. https://doi.org/10.1080/09692290903173087

Bevir, M, & Chan, KYS (2023). What is a deliberative system? A tale of two ontologies.

European Journal of Political Theory, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/14748851211034106

Böker, M, & Elstub, S (2015). The possibility of critical mini-publics: Realpolitik and

normative cycles in democratic theory. *Representation*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/00344893.2015.1026205

Boswell, J (2013). Why and how narrative matters in deliberative systems. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-9248.2012.00987.x

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Boswell, J (2016). Deliberating downstream: Countering democratic distortions in the policy process. *Perspectives on Politics*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/perspectives-on-politics/article/deliberating- downstream-countering-democratic-distortions-in-the-policy-process/196945A0B019F7CC8EA73E53BE9BD6DA

Boswell, J, Dean, R, & Smith, G (2023). Integrating citizen deliberation into climate governance: Lessons on robust design from six climate assemblies. *Public Administration*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/padm.12883

Boswell, J, Hendriks, CM, & Ercan, SA (2016). Message received? Examining transmission in deliberative systems. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2016.1188712

Boulianne, S (2019). Building faith in democracy: Deliberative events, political trust and efficacy. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0032321718761466

Bramwell, B, & Sharman, A (2002). Approaches to sustainable tourism planning and community participation: the case of the Hope Valley. *Tourism and sustainable community …*, taylorfrancis.com, https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203464915-8

Brunson, L., Lauzier-Jobin, F., Olson, B., & Côté, L. (2023). Seven key insights from critical realism and their implications for ecological thinking and action in community psychology.. *Journal of community psychology*. https://doi.org/10.1002/jcop.23054

Brydon, M, & Vining, AR (2016). Combining citizen participation and expert analysis: a wild, wild horses problem in British Columbia. *Local Government Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/03003930.2015.1081847

Bussu, S., Bua, A., Dean, R., & Smith, G. (2022). Introduction: Embedding participatory governance. *Critical Policy Studies, 16*, 133 - 145. https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2022.2053179

Chambers, S (2009). Rhetoric and the public sphere: Has deliberative democracy abandoned mass democracy?. *Political theory*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591709332336

Chambers, S (2017). Balancing epistemic quality and equal participation in a system approach to deliberative democracy. *Social Epistemology*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/02691728.2017.1317867

Çiçek, A. (2024). Deliberative Democracy in the Digital Age Opportunities and

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Challenges of Online Public Discourse. *Elektronik Cumhuriyet İletişim Dergisi*. https://doi.org/10.54089/ecider.1549272

Connelly, S., Richardson, T., & Miles, T. (2006). Situated legitimacy: Deliberative arenas and the new rural governance. *Journal of Rural Studies, 22*, 267-277. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jrurstud.2005.11.008

Consinide, Mark (1994), Public Policy: A Critical Approach, Mcmillan Education Australia PTY LTD: South Melbourne

Cross, B (2019). Deliberative systems theory and activism. *Critical Review of International Social and Political …*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/13698230.2019.1584842

Creswell, Jhon W & Creswell, J. David, 2018, *Research Desain: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*, Sage Publications, London

Creswell, Jhon W & Poth, Cheryl N, 2018, *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design : Choosing Among Five Approaches*, Sage Publications, London

Cross, B. (2021). Deliberative systems theory and activism.*Critical Review of International Social and Political Philosophy*,*24*(6), 866–883. https://doi.org/10.1080/13698230.2019.1584842

Courant, D (2022). Institutionalizing deliberative mini-publics? Issues of legitimacy and power for randomly selected assemblies in political systems. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2021.2000453

Curato, N (2021). Interruptive protests in dysfunctional deliberative systems. *Politics*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0263395720960297

Curato, N. (2021). Asserting disadvantaged communities' deliberative agency in a media- saturated society.*Theory and Society*,*50*, 657–677. https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1007/s11186-020-09421-1

Curato, N, & Böker, M (2016). Linking mini-publics to the deliberative system: A research agenda. *Policy Sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-015-9238-5

Curato, N, Dryzek, JS, Ercan, SA, Hendriks, CM, & ... (2017). Twelve key findings in deliberative democracy research. *Daedalus*, direct.mit.edu, https://direct.mit.edu/daed/article-abstract/146/3/28/27148

Curato, N, Niemeyer, S, & Dryzek, JS (2013). Appreciative and contestatory inquiry in deliberative forums: can group hugs be dangerous?. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2012.758595

Davis, R (2021). Australian Indigenous environment policy as a deliberative system.*Australian Journal of Political Science*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/10361146.2021.1998342

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Davis, R (2022). More than a 'voice': Indigenous transmission in the Murray-Darling Basin Plan. *Journal of Environmental Planning and Management*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/09640568.2022.2144165

Davis, R. (2024). Rethinking Australian democracy as a deliberative system.*AlterNative*,*20*, 521–530. https://doi.org/10.1177/11771801241261715

Davis, R. (2025). The Role of Indigenous Forums in Environmental Policy: A Deliberative Systems Approach.*Society & Natural reSourceS*. https://doi.org/10.1080/08941920.2025.2453988

Dean, R, Boswell, J, & Smith, G (2020). Designing democratic innovations as deliberative systems: The ambitious case of NHS citizen. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0032321719866002

De Jong, Willemijn (2015), Luka, Lawo, Ngawu – Kekayaan Kain Tenun dan Belis di Wilayah Lio, Flores Tengah, Ledalero, Maumere – Indonesia

De Keyser, B., Guiette, A., & Vandenbempt, K. (2019). On the dynamics of failure in organizational change: A dialectical perspective. *Human Relations, 74*, 234 - 257. https://doi.org/10.1177/0018726719884115

Dodge, J (2009). Environmental justice and deliberative democracy: How social change organizations respond to power in the deliberative system. *Policy and Society*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1016/j.polsoc.2009.08.005

Dodge, J (2014). Civil society organizations and deliberative policy making: interpreting environmental controversies in the deliberative system. *Policy Sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-014-9200-y

Dodge, J., & Metze, T. (2024). Approaches to policy framing: deepening a conversation across perspectives. *Policy Sciences, 57*, 221 - 256. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-024-09534-9

Does, R Van der, & Jacquet, V (2023). Small-scale deliberation and mass democracy: A systematic review of the spillover effects of deliberative minipublics. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/00323217211007278

Dryzek, JS, & Niemeyer, S (2008). Discursive representation. *American political science review*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/american-political- science-review/article/discursive-representation/125D95B3A86675D8F1275C8D4A6C773B

Dryzek, JS, & Tucker, A (2008). Deliberative innovation to different effect: Consensus conferences in Denmark, France, and the United States. *Public Administration Review*, Wiley Online Library,

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2008.00928.x

Dryzek, JS (2009). Democratization as deliberative capacity building. *Comparative political studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414009332129

Dryzek, JS (2010). Rhetoric in democracy: A systemic appreciation. *Political theory*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591709359596

Dryzek, JS (2010), *Deliberative Democracy and Beyond: Liberal, Critics, Contestations*, United Kingdom, Oxford University Press

Dryzek, JS (2013). The deliberative democrat's Idea of Justice. *European Journal of Political Theory*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/1474885112466784

Dryzek, JS (2015). Deliberative engagement: the forum in the system. *Journal of Environmental Studies and Sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s13412-015- 0299-8

Dryzek, JS (2016). Symposium commentary: Reflections on the theory of deliberative systems. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2016.1170620

Dryzek, JS (2017). The forum, the system, and the polity: Three varieties of democratic theory. *Political Theory*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591716659114

Dryzek, J., Bächtiger, A., Chambers, S., Cohen, J., Druckman, J., Felicetti, A., Fishkin, J., Farrell, D., Fung, A., Gutmann, A., Landemore, H., Mansbridge, J., Marien, S., Neblo, M., Niemeyer, S., Setälä, M., Slothuus, R., Suiter, J., Thompson, D., & Warren, M. (2019). The crisis of democracy and the science of deliberation. *Science*, 363, 1144 - 1146. https://doi.org/10.1126/science.aaw2694

Dye, T (2017), *Understanding Public Policy*. Pearson : Florida State University

Ebeling, M, & Wolkenstein, F (2018). Exercising deliberative agency in deliberative systems. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0032321717723514

Edwards, L. (2016). The Role of Public Relations in Deliberative Systems. *Journal of Communication*, 66, 60-81. https://doi.org/10.1111/jcom.12199

Ellison, E., & Langhout, R. (2022). Critical realism methodology as a guiding framework for interdisciplinary theory enrichment: Reflections on a study of empowerment.. *Journal of community psychology*. https://doi.org/10.1002/jcop.22919

Elstub, S (2010). The third generation of deliberative democracy. *Political studies review*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-9302.2010.00216.x

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Elstub, S, Ercan, S, & Mendonça, RF (2016). Editorial introduction: The fourth generation of deliberative democracy. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2016.1175956

Engelken-Jorge, M (2018). Minimally deliberative deliberative systems? Problematisation and the deliberative democratic effects of poorly deliberative communication. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0032321717710567

Ercan, SA, & Dryzek, JS (2015). The reach of deliberative democracy. *Policy studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2015.1065969

Ercan, SA, & Hendriks, CM (2013). The democratic challenges and potential of localism: insights from deliberative democracy. *Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2013.822701

Ercan, S., Hendriks, C., & Boswell, J. (2017). Studying public deliberation after the systemic turn: the crucial role for interpretive research. *Policy and Politics*, 45, 195-212. https://doi.org/10.1332/030557315x14502713105886

Erman, E (2019). Representation, equality, and inclusion in deliberative systems: Desiderata for a good account. *Equality and Representation*, taylorfrancis.com, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315111933-3

Esau, K., Fleuss, D., & Nienhaus, S.-M. (2020). Different Arenas, Different Deliberative Quality? Using a Systemic Framework to Evaluate Online Deliberation on Immigration Policy in Germany. *Policy & Internet*. https://doi.org/10.1002/poi3.232

Escobar, O., & Bua, A. (2025). Democratic innovation for change: A participatory corrective to deliberative hegemony. *Politics, 46*, 15 - 36. https://doi.org/10.1177/02633957251349635

Fainstein, SS (2015). Social justice and urban policy deliberation: balancing the discourses of democracy, diversity and equity. *Handbook of critical policy studies*, elgaronline.com, https://www.elgaronline.com/abstract/edcoll/9781783472345/9781783472345.00017. xml

Fan, M.-F. (2023). Democratising science in deliberative systems: Mobilising lay expertise against industry waste dumping in Taiwan.*Public Understanding of Science*. https://doi.org/10.1177/09636625221105600

Fan, MF, & Sung, SC (2022). Indigenous political participation in the deliberative systems: the long-term care service controversy in Taiwan. *Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2020.1760233

Fan, M.-F. (2024). Reclaiming energy justice in Taiwan? Insights on deliberation democracy from the Thao Tribe's renewable energy initiative.*Energy Research & Social Science*.

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

https://doi.org/10.1016/j.erss.2024.103485

Felicetti, A (2014). Citizen forums in the deliberative system. *Democratic Theory*, berghahnjournals.com, https://www.berghahnjournals.com/view/journals/democratic-theory/1/2/dt010210.xml

Felicetti, A (2018). Non-deliberative politics in deliberative democracy: Distinct approaches for different actors. *Italian Political Science Review/Rivista Italiana di …*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/italian-political-science-review-rivista-italiana-di-scienza-politica/article/nondeliberative-politics-in- deliberative-democracy-distinct-approaches-for-different-actors/05471A5604B32CA6886647CD22EB56B5

Felicetti, A, Niemeyer, S, & Curato, N (2016). Improving deliberative participation: Connecting mini-publics to deliberative systems. *European Political Science …*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/european-political-science-review/article/improving-deliberative-participation-connecting-minipublics-to-

deliberative-systems/2EE58636F2D6152EE41B611CD9825EA9

Fleuß, D, & Deppe, C (2025). Transmissions, Decisions, Discourses–A Methodological Framework for Measuring and Comparing Democratic Innovations' Policy-Impact (s). *Swiss Political Science Review*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/spsr.12657

Fischer, F (2003). *Reframing public policy: Discursive politics and deliberative practices*., Oxford University Press

Fischer, F (2006). Participatory governance as deliberative empowerment: The cultural politics of discursive space. *The American review of public administration*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0275074005282582

Fischer, F (2010). Policy deliberation: confronting subjectivity and emotional expression. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171003619832

Fischer, F, & Gottweis, H (2012). *The argumentative turn revisited: Public policy as communicative practice*., books.google.com, https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=r-Q8hDsB92IC&oi=fnd&pg=PR5&dq=the+argumentative+turn&ots=jp45inGX3e&sig= FRu-l_9iSc-dq2qpf_xOXaKIaqQ

Fishkin, JS (2003). Consulting the public through deliberative polling. *Journal of policy analysis and management*, JSTOR, https://www.jstor.org/stable/3325851

Gibson, Christopher & Woolcook, Michael, (2005), Empowerment and Local

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Level Conflict Mediation in Indonesia : A Comparative Analysis of Concepts, Measures and Project Efficacy, World Bank Policy Research Working Paper.

Görsdorf, A (2006). Inside deliberative experiments: dynamics of subjectivity in science policy deliberations. *Policy and society*, Elsevier, https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1449403506700789

Gregory, J, Watson, R, & Hartz-Karp, J (2008). Using deliberative techniques to engage the community in policy development. *Australia and New Zealand …*, CSIRO Publishing, https://www.publish.csiro.au/hp/hp080516

Grönlund, K, Herne, K, Jäske, M, & ... (2022). Can politicians and citizens deliberate together? Evidence from a local deliberative mini-public. *Scandinavian Political …*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9477.12231

Habermas, J. (2006). Political Communication in Media Society: Does Democracy Still Enjoy an Epistemic Dimension? The Impact of Normative Theory on Empirical Research. *Communication Theory*, 16, 411-426. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2885.2006.00280.x

Haigh, F., Kemp, L., Bazeley, P., & Haigh, N. (2019). Developing a critical realist informed framework to explain how the human rights and social determinants of health relationship works. *BMC Public Health, 19*. https://doi.org/10.1186/s12889-019-7760-7

Häikiö, L (2012). From innovation to convention: Legitimate citizen participation in local governance. *Local government studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/03003930.2012.698241

Hajer, M (2003). Policy without polity? Policy analysis and the institutional void. *Policy sciences*, Springer, ttps://doi.org/10.1023/A:1024834510939

Hajer, M, Hajer, MA, Wagenaar, H, Goodin, RE, & Barry, B (2003). *Deliberative policy analysis: understanding governance in the network society*., United Kingdom, Cambridge University Press

Hakim, L., Kolopaking, L., Sjaf, S., & Kinseng, R. (2025). Assessing village democracy and welfare in rural Indonesia: an index-based correlation analysis. *Frontiers in Political Science*. https://doi.org/10.3389/fpos.2025.1622507

Hammond, M (2019). Deliberative democracy as a critical theory. *Critical review of international Social and Political …*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/13698230.2018.1438333

He, B. (2018). Deliberative citizenship and deliberative governance: a case study of one deliberative experimental in China.*Citizenship Studies*,*22*(3), 294–311. https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2018.1424800

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

He, B, Breen, M, Fishkin, J (2022) *Deliberative Democracy in Asia*, New York, Routledge: Taylor & Francis Group

He, B., & Wagenaar, H. (2018). Authoritarian deliberation revisited.*Japanese Journal of Political Science*,*19*, 622–629. https://doi.org/10.1017/S1468109918000257

He, B, & Warren, ME (2011). Authoritarian deliberation: The deliberative turn in Chinese political development. *Perspectives on politics*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/perspectives-on-politics/article/authoritarian-deliberation-the-deliberative-turn-in-chinese-political-development/5B8944AA133D4BB08BAD8FD713723C0C

Hendriks, CM (2005). Participatory storylines and their influence on deliberative forums.
Policy sciences, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-005-0870-3

Hendriks, C. (2016). Coupling citizens and elites in deliberative systems: The role of institutional design. *European Journal of Political Research*, 55, 43-60. https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6765.12123

Herzog, L, & Lepenies, R (2022). Citizen science in deliberative systems: Participation, epistemic injustice, and civic empowerment. *Minerva*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11024-022-09467-8

Hogan, J and Howlett, M (2015), Policy Paradigms in Theory and Practice : Discourses, Ideas and Anomalies in Public Policy Dynamics, Palgrave Macmillan : England

Holdo, M (2016). Deliberative capital: Recognition in participatory budgeting. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2015.1077718

Holdo, M (2020). A relational perspective on deliberative systems: Combining interpretive and structural analysis. *Critical policy studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2018.1506349

Holdo, M (2020). Meta-deliberation: Everyday acts of critical reflection in deliberative systems. *Politics*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0263395719837914

Holdo, M (2020). Violations of basic deliberative norms: The systemic turn and problems of inclusion. *Politics*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0263395719887329

Howlett, M, & Mukherjee, I (2017). *Handbook of policy formulation*., books.google.com, https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=P_6lDgAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PR1&dq
=handbook+of+policy+formulation&ots=40xnacAy8b&sig=us3fCk7Yy4UBuw

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

qnIdiTjS X3VXs

Howlett, M, & Ramesh, M (2016). A chilles' heels of governance: critical capacity deficits and their role in governance failures. *Regulation &Governance*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/rego.12091

Innes, JE, & Booher, DE (2003). Collaborative policymaking: governance through dialogue.

Deliberative policy analysis: Understanding …, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/services/aop-cambridge-core/content/view/D790F304E466EC2A6E46361B92A29ADE

Jacquet, V, & Does, R van der (2021). Deliberation and policy-making: Three ways to think about minipublics' consequences. *Administration &Society*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0095399720964511

Jalonen, H. (2024). Epistemic Governance in the Context of Crisis: A Complexity-informed Approach. *Administration & Society, 57*, 218 - 253. https://doi.org/10.1177/00953997241303935

James, T. (2024). Real Democracy: A Critical Realist Approach to Democracy and Democratic Theory. *New Political Science, 46*, 228 - 258. https://doi.org/10.1080/07393148.2024.2382644

Janssen, M., & Voort, H. V. D. (2020). Agile and adaptive governance in crisis response: Lessons from the COVID-19 pandemic. *International Journal of Information Management, 55*, 102180 - 102180. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijinfomgt.2020.102180

Johnson, GF (2011). The limits of deliberative democracy and empowerment: elite motivation in three Canadian cases. *Canadian Journal of Political Science/Revue …*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/canadian-journal-of- political-science-revue-canadienne-de-science-politique/article/limits-of-deliberative- democracy-and-empowerment-elite-motivation-in-three-canadian- cases/439DCECAEF5797C89EA84520BBFD6A37

Johnson, GF (2017). The role of public participation and deliberation in policy formulation.*Handbook of policy formulation*, elgaronline.com, https://www.elgaronline.com/abstract/edcoll/9781784719319/9781784719319.00019. xml

Jörke, D (2010). The epistemic turn of critical theory: implications for deliberative politics and policy-making. *Critical policy studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171003620558

Junius, N (2024). From representative to represented mini-publics: How mini-publics' outputs are shaped by representation. *Political Studies Review*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/14789299231217619

Kenter, J., Jobstvogt, N., Watson, V., Irvine, K., Christie, M., & Bryce, R. (2016). The impact of information, value-deliberation and group-based decision-making on values for ecosystem services: integrating

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

deliberative monetary valuation and storytelling. *Ecosystem services, 21*, 270-290. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoser.2016.06.006

Kessa, Mahyudin, (2015), *Perencanaan Pembangunan Desa*, Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi Republik Indonesia, Jakarta

Kiss, B., Sekulova, F., Hörschelmann, K., Salk, C. F., Takahashi, W., & Wamsler, C. (2022). Citizen participation in the governance of nature-based solutions. *Environmental Policy and Governance*. https://doi.org/10.1002/eet.1987

Knops, A (2016). Deliberative networks. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2016.1188713

Kuyper, J (2015). Democratic deliberation in the modern world: The systemic turn. *Critical Review*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/08913811.2014.993891

Kuyper, JW (2018). The instrumental value of deliberative democracy-Or, do we have good reasons to be deliberative democrats?. *Journal of public deliberation*, duo.uio.no, https://www.duo.uio.no/handle/10852/67168

Łabuz, M, & Strnad, G (2025). Political Advertising With the Use of Deep Fakes—Can Deliberative Democracy Really Benefit From This Strategy?. *Politics &Policy*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/polp.70035

Lafont, C. (2019). Democracy without Shortcuts. *Constellations.* https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8675.12432

Lawani, A. (2020). Critical realism: what you should know and how to apply it. *Qualitative Research Journal*. https://doi.org/10.1108/qrj-08-2020-0101

Leydet, D (2015). Partisan legislatures and democratic deliberation. *Journal of Political Philosophy*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/jopp.12043

Lele, Gabriel, 2023, Kebijakan Publik Untuk Transformasi Sosial : Sebuah Pendekatan Kritis –Agonistik, Gadjah Mada University Press, Yogyakarta

Li, Y (2015). Think tank 2.0 for deliberative policy analysis. *Policy Sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-014-9207-4

Li, Y, & He, J (2016). Exploring deliberative policy analysis in an authoritarian country. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2016.1170619

Mansbridge, J, Bohman, J, Chambers, S, & ... (2012). A systemic approach to deliberative democracy. *Deliberative systems …*, books.google.com, https://books.google.com/books?hl=en&lr=&id=uIUhAwAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PA1

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

&dq=mansbridge+deliberative&ots=vg2Z0vpiMS&sig=RI6E5rW4uOCLS 9MxWW52 Pk99uKQ

Martínez-Bascuñán, M (2016). Misgivings on Deliberative Democracy: Revisiting the Deliberative Framework. *World Political Science*, degruyter.com, https://doi.org/10.1515/wps-2016-0006

McAfee, N. (2021). Democracy without shortcuts: A participatory conception of deliberative democracy. *Contemporary Political Theory*, 21, 55 - 58. https://doi.org/10.1057/s41296-021-00519-4

McLaverty, P, & Halpin, D (2008). Deliberative drift: The emergence of deliberation in the policy process. *International political science review*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0192512107085612

Mendonça, R., Veloso, L. N., Magalhães, B. D., & Motta, F. (2024). Deliberative ecologies: a relational critique of deliberative systems. *European Political Science Review*. https://doi.org/10.1017/s1755773923000358

Milewicz, KM, & Goodin, RE (2018). Deliberative capacity building through international organizations: The case of the Universal Periodic Review of human rights. *British Journal of Political Science*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/british-journal-of-political-science/article/deliberative-capacity-building-through-international-organizations-the-case-of-the-universal-periodic-review-of-human-rights/EC240D7912437999795DD8D15378B175

Moore, A (2012). Following from the front: Theorizing deliberative facilitation. *Critical policy studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2012.689735

Moore, A (2019). Deliberative elitism? Distributed deliberation and the organization of epistemic inequality. *Deliberative Systems in Theory and Practice*, taylorfrancis.com, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351182645-4

Motta, FM, & Mendonça, RF (2023). Assimetria informacional, poder e sistemas deliberativos: uma análise de conflitos ambientais em Minas Gerais. *Revista de Sociologia e Política*, SciELO Brasil, https://www.scielo.br/j/rsocp/a/Q4TnB7xfR4HSKzg9zSJrDHm/

Montpetit, É, Scala, F, & Fortier, I (2004). The paradox of deliberative democracy: The National Action Committee on the Status of Women and Canada's policy on reproductive technology. *Policy sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1023/B:OLIC.0000048531.47103.3a

Mulyadi, D, Gedeona, H.T, (2017), Demokrasi, Governance, dan Ruang Publik Dalam Kajian Administrasi Publik, Alfabeta CV : Bandung

Muradova, L (2021). Seeing the other side? Perspective-taking and reflective political judgements in interpersonal deliberation. *Political Studies*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0032321720916605

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Neill, J (2013). Deliberative Institutions and Conversational Participation in Liberal Democracies. *Social theory and practice*, JSTOR, https://www.jstor.org/stable/23558605

Nekola, M, & Kohoutek, J (2017). Policy formulation as policy work: developing options for government. *Handbook of policy formulation*, elgaronline.com, https://www.elgaronline.com/abstract/edcoll/9781784719319/9781784719319.00008. xml

Neuman, W.L, (2006), Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches (sixth Edition), Pearson Education : United State of America

Newman, J (2012). Beyond the deliberative subject? Problems of theory, method and critique in the turn to emotion and affect. *Critical Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/19460171.2012.730799

Niemeyer, S, Veri, F, Dryzek, JS, & ... (2023). How deliberation happens: enabling deliberative reason. *American Political Science …*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/american-political-science- review/article/how-deliberation-happens-enabling-deliberative- reason/6558F69855ADA8B15BF2EC2E5D403E71

Niessen, C (2019). When citizen deliberation enters real politics: how politicians and stakeholders envision the place of a deliberative mini-public in political decision-making. *Policy Sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-018-09346-8

Niessen, C., & Reuchamps, M. (2020). Institutionalising Citizen Deliberation in Parliament: The Permanent Citizens' Dialogue in the German-speaking Community of Belgium. *Parliamentary Affairs*. https://doi.org/10.1093/pa/gsaa056

O'Flynn, I, & Curato, N (2015). Deliberative democratization: a framework for systemic analysis. *Policy Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2015.1065965

Park, L., & Peter, S. (2022). Application of critical realism in social work research: Methodological considerations. *Aotearoa New Zealand Social Work*. https://doi.org/10.11157/anzswj-vol34iss2id932

Parkinson, J., and J. Mansbridge. 2012. *Deliberative Systems: Deliberative Democracy at the Large Scale*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Parra, J., Said-Hung, E., & Montoya-Vargas, J. (2021). (Re)introducing critical realism as a paradigm to inform qualitative content analysis in causal educational research. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 34*, 168 - 182. https://doi.org/10.1080/09518398.2020.1735555

Patriani, I., Lutfie, R. Z., Dina, A., & Pakpahan, S. (2022). *Public Policy Based On Deliberative Democracy: Study on User Charges for the Use of*

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Rasan Village Roads, Landak Regency, Indonesia.

Pigg, Kenneth E, (2002), Three Faces of Empowerment: Expanding the Theory of Empowerment in Community Development, Journal of the Community Development Society, Vol 33 (1), p 107-123

Pedrini, S (2014). Deliberative capacity in the political and civic sphere. *Swiss political science review*, Wiley Online Library, https://doi.org/10.1111/spsr.12074

Pogrebinschi, T, & Ryan, M (2018). Moving beyond input legitimacy: When do democratic innovations affect policy making?. *European Journal of Political Research*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/european-journal-of-political-research/article/moving-beyond-input-legitimacy-when-do-democratic-innovations-affect-policy-making/D4CBF38BC2DD30228BF9D274A6233E1A

Putra, Anaom Surya (2015), *Badan Usaha Milik Desa: Spirit Usaha Kolektif Desa*, Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi Republik Indonesia, Jakarta

Ramda, E. (2025). Deliberative Public Policy of Village Governance: Legal-Historical Notes During the Implementation of Regional Autonomy. *Bestuurskunde: Journal of Governmental Studies*. https://doi.org/10.53013/bestuurskunde.5.1.67-78

Reckers-Droog, V, Jansen, M, Bijlmakers, L, Baltussen, R, & ... (2020). How does participating in a deliberative citizens panel on healthcare priority setting influence the views of participants?. *Health Policy*, Elsevier,

https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0168851019302805

Riedy, C, & Kent, J (2015). Australian climate action groups in the deliberative system. *Environmental politics*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/09644016.2015.1008235

Roberts, JJ, Lightbody, R, Low, R, & Elstub, S (2020). Experts and evidence in deliberation: Scrutinising the role of witnesses and evidence in mini-publics, a case study. *Policy Sciences*, Springer, https://doi.org/10.1007/s11077-019-09367-x

Rollo, T (2017). Everyday deeds: Enactive protest, exit, and silence in deliberative systems. *Political Theory*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591716661222

Sass, J, & Dryzek, JS (2014). Deliberative cultures. *Political Theory*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591713507933

Setälä, M (2017). Connecting deliberative mini-publics to representative decision making. *European Journal of Political Research*, cambridge.org, https://www.cambridge.org/core/journals/european-journal-of-political-research/article/connecting-deliberative-minipublics-

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

to-representative-decision-making/A96C174F8FD6A01ABAD6E5A5D2ED8C3C

Schmitt-Beck, R, & Grill, C (2020). From the living room to the meeting hall? Citizens' political talk in the deliberative system. *Political Communication*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/10584609.2020.1760974

Scudder, MF, Ercan, SA, & McCallum, K (2023). Institutional listening in deliberative democracy: Towards a deliberative logic of transmission. *Politics*, journals.sagepub.com, https://doi.org/10.1177/02633957211060691

Shahi, M. B. (2025). Assessing the Culture of Deliberation in Local Governance: Evidence from Four Municipalities in Kailali, Nepal. *Far Western Review*. https://doi.org/10.3126/fwr.v3i1.84663

Silahuddin, M, 2015, *Kewenangan Desa dan Regulasi Desa*, Kementerian Desa, Pembangunan Daerah Tertinggal, dan Transmigrasi Republik Indonesia, Jakarta

Späth, L, & Scolobig, A (2017). Stakeholder empowerment through participatory planning practices: The case of electricity transmission lines in France and Norway. *Energy research &social science*, Elsevier, https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S2214629616302377

Smith, W (2016). The boundaries of a deliberative system: The case of disruptive protest. *Deliberative systems in theory and practice*, taylorfrancis.com, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781351182645-2

Smith, W (2019). Deliberative citizenship: a critical reappraisal. *Citizenship Studies*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2019.1664404

Stavrianos, A. (2025). Unveiling the Layers of Reality: An Exploration of Critical Realism in Interdisciplinary Research. *Educational Theory*. https://doi.org/10.1111/edth.70039

Tang, B. (2015). The Discursive Turn: deliberative governance in China's urbanized villages. *Journal of Contemporary China, 24*, 137 - 157. https://doi.org/10.1080/10670564.2014.918414

Thompson, DF (2008). Deliberative democratic theory and empirical political science. *Annu. Rev. Polit. Sci.*, annualreviews.org, https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.polisci.11.081306.070555

Townsend, R. M., & Reiss, C. C. (2022). An Enduring System of Local Deliberative Democracy: The 21st Century Legal and Normative Structure of Massachusetts Town Meeting.*Journal of Deliberative Democracy,18*, 1–10. https://doi.org/10.16997/jdd.1136

Wagenaar, H, & Wenninger, F (2020). Deliberative policy analysis, interconnectedness and institutional design: lessons from “Red Vienna”.

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
Dimensi relasional dalam proses transmisi deliberatif dan pemberdayaan dalam proses perumusan kebijakan
Bartholy Antony Surya Lengo, Prof. Dr. Gabriel Lele, M.Si; Dr. Nurhadi Susanto, M.Hum
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2026 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

Policy studies, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/01442872.2020.1717456

Wilder, M (2017). Policy paradigms and the formulation process. *Handbook Of Policy Formulation*, elgaronline.com, https://www.elgaronline.com/abstract/edcoll/9781784719319/9781784719319.00036. xml

Yin, RK (2015). *Qualitative research from start to finish*., Guilford publications

Zanella, M Alves, Goetz, A, Rist, S, Schmidt, O, & Weigelt, J (2018). Deliberation in multi- stakeholder participation: A heuristic framework applied to the Committee on World Food Security. *Sustainability*, mdpi.com, https://www.mdpi.com/2071-1050/10/2/428

Zgiep, M (2019). Beyond institutions and the system: Network approach to deliberative democracy. *Cogent Social Sciences*, Taylor &Francis, https://doi.org/10.1080/23311886.2019.1639876