

Abstract

Indonesia's import on second-hand clothes (SHC) still prevails despite multiple policies having been enacted to prohibit the import, with the recent regulation being Ministry of Trade Regulation No. 40 of 2022 (Permendag No. 40 of 2022). Imports of second-hand clothes in Indonesia pose threats to the competitiveness of domestic textile and textile products' (TTP) industry, potentially risking public health, and adding loads of potential textile waste. However, SHC products have developed into markets and provide clothing options for Indonesia's majority lower-class. Regulations faced several provisions, however, activities of illegal imports and sales of SHC remained high. Previous research on this topic primarily focused on regional implementation of the regulation and thus seldom to portray the overarching policy dynamics of the regulation. This research uses Nugroho's (2012) "five-right" analytical lens on effectiveness to study whether criteria are met and uses a policy coherence framework adopted from several prominent studies to understand policy interactions of the ban with other relevant policies. These research findings suggest that implementation effectiveness of Permendag No. 40 of 2022 faces challenges in translating policy design to practice, mainly due to public compliance and lenient enforcement. While policy coherence of the regulation suggests that trade, industry, and economic protection highly reinforces the regulation, the policy interaction within sustainability perspectives is rather disconnected than conflicting or synergising.

Keywords: Implementation effectiveness; policy coherence; second-hand clothing; import ban; textile sector; circular economy; Indonesia

Abstrak

Larangan impor pakaian bekas (second-hand clothes/SHC) di Indonesia masih berlangsung meskipun berbagai kebijakan telah diterbitkan untuk melarang impor tersebut; regulasi terbaru adalah Peraturan Menteri Perdagangan Nomor 40 Tahun 2022 (Permendag 40/2022). Impor SHC dipandang mengancam daya saing industri tekstil dan produk tekstil (TPT) domestik, berpotensi menimbulkan risiko kesehatan publik, serta menambah beban limbah tekstil. Namun, SHC telah berkembang menjadi pasar tersendiri dan menyediakan pilihan pakaian bagi mayoritas masyarakat berpendapatan rendah. Walaupun regulasi memuat sejumlah ketentuan, praktik impor ilegal dan peredaran SHC tetap tinggi. Riset terdahulu umumnya menitikberatkan pada implementasi kebijakan di tingkat daerah sehingga jarang menggambarkan dinamika kebijakan secara menyeluruh. Penelitian ini menggunakan lensa analisis “lima tepat” Nugroho untuk menilai terpenuhinya kriteria efektivitas implementasi, serta mengadopsi kerangka koherensi kebijakan dari sejumlah studi utama untuk memahami interaksi larangan dengan kebijakan lain yang relevan. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa efektivitas implementasi Permendag 40/2022 menghadapi tantangan dalam menerjemahkan desain kebijakan ke praktik, terutama akibat kepatuhan publik yang rendah dan penegakan yang longgar. Sementara itu, koherensi kebijakan mengindikasikan bahwa kebijakan perdagangan, industri, dan proteksi ekonomi sangat memperkuat regulasi tersebut, tetapi interaksi kebijakan dari perspektif keberlanjutan cenderung terputus, bukan bersifat konfliktual maupun sinergis.

Kata kunci: *efektivitas implementasi; koherensi kebijakan; pakaian bekas; larangan impor; sektor tekstil; ekonomi sirkular; Indonesia.*