

## DAFTAR PUSTAKA

- Ahmadova, M. (2015). *Regulating Teacher-Provided Private Supplementary Tutoring in Azerbaijan: Challenges and Possible Responses*. (Master's Dissertation). Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong.
- Altinyelken, H. K. (2013). *The Demand for Private Tutoring in Turkey: Unintended Consequences of Curriculum Reform*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill.
- Aslam, M., & Atherton, P. (2012). *The 'Shadow' Education Sector in India and Pakistan: The Determinants, Benefits and Equity Effects of Private Tutoring*. Education Support Programme Working Paper Series 38, Budapest: Open Society Foundations.
- Aurini, J., Davies, S., & Dierkes, J. (2013). *Out of the Shadows: The Global Intensification of Supplementary Education*. Bingley: Emerald Publishing.
- Baily, S. (2012). *Framing the World Bank Education Strategy 2020 to the Indian Context: Alignments, Challenges, and Opportunities*. Bingley: Emerald Books
- Ball, S. J. & Youdell, D. (2008). *Hidden Privatisation in Public Education*.
- Baker, D. P., Akiba, M., Letendre, G. K., & Wiseman, A. W. (2001). *Worldwide Shadow Education: Outside-School Learning, Institutional Quality of Schooling, and Cross-National Mathematics Achievement*. Educational Evaluation and Policy Analysis, 23(1), 1-17.
- Baker, D., & Letendre, G. K. (2005). *National Differences, Global Similarities: World Culture and the Future of Schooling*. Stanford University Press.
- Barokal, L. I. & Utomo, P. P. (2022). *Kajian Eksploratif Partisipasi Siswa Pada Bimbel di Luar Sekolah (Shadow Education) dan Determinannya: Studi Kasus SMAN 3 Yogyakarta* (Doctoral Dissertation, Universitas Gadjah Mada).
- Batley, R. (1994). The Consolidation of Adjustment: Implications for Public Administration. *Public Administration and Development*, 14(5), 489-505.
- Benn, S. I., & Gaus, G. F. (1983). The Liberal Conception of the Public and the Private. *Public and Private in Social Life*, 31.
- Borodchuk, N. (2011). *Shadow Education: Quantitative and Qualitative Analysis of the Impact of Education Reform (Implementation of Centralized and Standardized Testing) on Private Tutoring in Ukraine* (LSE Working Paper Series No. 11).

- Bourgon, J. (2007). Responsive, Responsible, and Respected Government: Towards a New Public Administration Theory. *International Review of Administrative Sciences*, 73(1), 7-26.
- Box, R. C. (2009). *Public Administration and Society: Critical Issues in American Governance*. Armonk, NY & London: M.E. Sharpe.
- Bozeman, B. (1987). *All Organizations are Public: Bridging Public and Private Organizational Theories*. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Bozeman, B., & Bretschneider, S. (1994). The “Publicness Puzzle” in Organization Theory: A Test of Alternative Explanations of Differences between Public and Private Organizations. *Journal of Public Administration Research and Theory*, 4(2), 197-224.
- Bray, M. (1999). *The Shadow Education System: Private Tutoring and Its Implications for Planners*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP).
- Bray, M. (2009). *Confronting the Shadow Education System: What Government Policies for What Private Tutoring?*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP).
- Bray, M. (2010). Researching Shadow Education: Methodological Challenges and Directions. *Asian Pacific Educational Review*, 11, 3–13.
- Bray, M. (2013). Shadow Education: Comparative Perspectives on the Expansion and Implications of Private Supplementary Tutoring. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 77, 412-420.
- Bray, M. (2014). The Impact of Shadow Education on Student Academic Achievement: Why The Research is Inconclusive and What Can Be Done About It. *Asia Pacific Educational Review*, 15, 381–389.
- Bray, M. (2017). Schooling and Its Supplements: Changing Global Patterns and Implications for Comparative Education. *Comparative Education Review*, 61(3), 469–491.
- Bray, M. (2020). Shadow Education in Europe: Growing Prevalence, Underlying Forces, and Policy Implications. *ECNU Review of Education*, 4(3), 442-475.
- Bray, M. (2023). Governing Private Tutoring for Public Good: Lessons from International Experiences. *PROSPECTS*, 1-9.
- Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., Junyan, L., & Zhang, W. (2016). The Internal Dynamics of Privatised Public Education: Fee-Charging Supplementary Tutoring Provided by Teachers in Cambodia. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 49, 291–299.

- Bray, M., & Kwo, O. (2013). Behind the Façade of Fee-Free Education: Shadow Education and Its Implications for Social Justice. *Oxford Review of Education*, 39(4), 480-497.
- Bray, M., & Kwok, P. (2003). Demand for Private Supplementary Tutoring: Conceptual Considerations, and Socio-Economic Patterns in Hong Kong. *Economics of Education Review*, 22(6), 611-620.
- Bray, M. & Lykins, C. (2012). *Shadow Education: Private Tutoring and Its Implications for Policy Makers in Asia*. Hong Kong: Comparative Education Research Center (CERC) and Asian Development Bank.
- Bray, M., Mazawi, A. E., & Sultana, R. G. (2013). *Private Tutoring Across the Mediterranean: Power Dynamics and Implications for Learning and Equity*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- Bray, M., Kobakhidze, M. N., Liu, J., & Zhang, W. (2016). The Internal Dynamics of Privatised Public Education: Fee-Charging Supplementary Tutoring Provided by Teachers in Cambodia. *International Journal of Educational Development*, 49, 291-299
- Brehm, W. C., Silova, I., & Tuot, M. (2012). Hidden Privatization of Public Education in Cambodia: The Impact and Implications of Private Tutoring. *Education Support Programme Working Paper Series*, 29.
- Brehm, W. (2015). *Enacting Educational Spaces: A Landscape Portrait of Privatization in Cambodia*. (Doctoral Dissertation). Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong.
- Buchmann, C., Condron, D. J., & Roscigno, V. J. (2010). Shadow Education, American Style: Test Preparation, the SAT and College Enrollment. *Social Forces*, 89(2), 435-461.
- Buhagiar, M. A., & Chetcuti, D. A. (2013). *The Private Tuition Phenomenon in Malta: Moving Toward a Fairer Education System*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill.
- Bukowski, P. (2017). *Shadow Education Within the European Union from the Perspective of Investment in Education*. A Study for the European Commission Directorate General Education and Culture.
- Byun, S. Y., & Kim, K. (2008). Parental Involvement and Student Achievement in South Korea: Focusing on Differential Effects by Family Background. *Korean Journal of Sociology of Education*, 18(1), 39-66.
- Byun, S. (2010). Does Policy Matter in Shadow Education Spending? Revisiting the Effects of the High School Equalization Policy in South Korea. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11, 83-96.

- Byun, S. Y., & Park, H. (2012). The Academic Success of East Asian American Youth: The Role of Shadow Education. *Sociology of Education*, 85(1), 40-60.
- Byun, S. Y., Chung, H. J., & Baker, D. P. (2018). Global Patterns of The Use of Shadow Education: Student, Family, and National Influences. *Research in the Sociology of Education*, 20, 71-105.
- Choi, J. (2012). *Unequal Access to Shadow Education and Its Impacts on Academic Outcomes: Evidence from Korea*. Paper Presented At Spring 2012 Meeting of ISA RC 28 'Economic Transformation and Social Stratification in Comparative Perspectives', 10–13 May, Hong Kong.
- Choi, Y., & Park, H. (2016). Shadow Education and Educational Inequality in South Korea: Examining Effect Heterogeneity of Shadow Education on Middle School Seniors' Achievement Test Scores. *Research in Social Stratification and Mobility*, 44, 22-32.
- Chou, C. P. (2014). A Matter of Trust: Shadow Education in Taiwan. *Revue Internationale d'éducation de Sèvres*. Retrieved from <http://journals.openedition.org/ries/3800>
- Creswell, J. W., & Creswell, J. D. (2018). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. Fifth Edition. Los Angeles, SAGE.
- Creswell, J. W. & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative Inquiry & Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. 4th Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Crotty, J. M. (2012). Global Private Tutoring Market Will Surpass \$102.8 Billion by 2018. *Forbes Magazine*, 30.
- Dang, H. A. (2007). The Determinants and Impact of Private Tutoring Classes in Vietnam. *Economics of Education Review*, 26(6), 683–698.
- Dang, H. A., & Rogers, F. H. (2008). The Growing Phenomenon of Private Tutoring: Does It Deepen Human Capital, Widen Inequalities, or Waste Resources?. *The World Bank Research Observer*, 23(2), 161-200.
- Direktorat Pendidikan Agama Islam. (2021, Maret 18). *Sebanyak 70% Siswa Sulit Memahami Materi Selama Pembelajaran Daring*. *Pendis Kemenag*. Retrieved November 23, 2023, from <https://Pendis.Kemenag.Go.Id/Pai/Berita/Sebanyak-70-Siswa-Sulit-Memahami-Materi-Selama-Pembelajaran-Daring-Qahk3>

- Dohmen, D., Erbes, A., Fuchs, K. and Günzel, J. (2008). Was Wissen Wir Über Nachhilfe? – Sachstand Und Auswertung Der forschungsliteratur Zu Angebot, Nachfrage Und Wirkungen. Berlin: forschungsinstitut Für Bildungs Und Sozialökonomie.
- Faganel, A., & Trnavčević, A. (2013). *Constructions of Private Tutoring in Slovenian Online Chatrooms: A Content Analysis*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill.
- Feng, S. (2021). The Evolution of Shadow Education in China: From Emergence to Capitalisation. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*, 11(2), 89-100.
- Feng, S., & Bray, M. (2019). *Outside-School-Time Activities and Shadow Education*. London: Sage.
- Hartmann, S. (2013). *Education 'Home Delivery' in Egypt: Private Tutoring and Social Stratification*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill.
- Haque, M. S. (2001). The Diminishing Publicness of Public Service Under the Current Mode of Governance. *Public Administration Review*, 61(1), 65-82.
- Holloway, S. L., & Kirby, P. (2020). Neoliberalising Education: New Geographies of Private Tuition, Class Privilege, and Minority Ethnic Advancement. *Antipode*, 52(1), 164-184.
- Ireson, J. (2004). Private Tutoring: How Prevalent and Effective Is It?. *London Review of Education*, 2(2), 109-122.
- Kassotakis, M., & Verdis, A. (2013). *Shadow Education in Greece: Characteristics, Consequences and Eradication Efforts*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill.
- Kawedhar, M. C., Mulyani, S., Saputro, S., & Yamtinah, S. (2020). Shadow Education in Indonesia: Is It Relevant to Students' Critical Thinking Skills in Chemistry Learning?. *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research*, 19(11), 223-241.
- Kementerian Pendidikan, Kebudayaan, Riset, Dan Teknologi. (2020, August 7). *Penyesuaian Keputusan Bersama Empat Menteri Tentang Panduan Pembelajaran di Masa Pandemi COVID-19*. Kementerian Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan Republik Indonesia. Retrieved November 21, 2023, From <https://www.kemdikbud.go.id/main/blog/2020/08/Penyesuaian-Keputusan-Bersama-Empat-Menteri-Tentang-Panduan-Pembelajaran-Di-Masa-Pandemi-Covid19>
- Koppell, J. G. (2010). Administration without Borders. *Public Administration Review*, 70, s46-s55.

- Kim, Y. C. (2016). *Shadow Education, Curriculum, and Culture of Schooling in South Korea*. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kim, Y. C., & Jung, J.-H. (2019). *Shadow Education as Worldwide Curriculum Studies*. Cham, Switzerland: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Kobakhidze, M. N. (2014). Corruption Risks of Private Tutoring: Case of Georgia. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 34(4), 455-475.
- Kobakhidze, M. N. (2018). *Teachers as Tutors: Shadow Education Market Dynamics in Georgia*. Springer International Publishing.
- Kwok, P. (2010). Demand Intensity, Market Parameters, and Policy Responses towards Demand and Supply of Private Supplementary Tutoring in China. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 49–58.
- Lamprianou, I., & Lamprianou, T. A. (2013). *Charting Private Tutoring in Cyprus: A Socio-Demographic Perspective*. Leiden, the Netherlands: Brill.
- Lee, C. J., Park, H. J., & Lee, H. (2009). *Shadow Education System*. New York: Routledge for the American Educational Research Association.
- Lee, C. J., Lee, H., & Jang, H. M. (2010). The History of Policy Responses to Shadow Education in South Korea: Implications for the Next Cycle of Policy Responses. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11, 97-108.
- Lehotka, I. (2021). Shadow Education in Myanmar. Private Supplementary Tutoring and Its Policy Implications. *Hungarian Educational Research Journal*, 11(2), 222-224.
- Liu, J. (2019). A Structural Equation Modeling Analysis of Parental Factors Underlying the Demand for Private Supplementary Tutoring in China. *ECNU Review of Education*, 2(1), 7-24.
- Lune, H., & Berg, B. L. (2017). *Qualitative Research Methods for the Social Sciences*.
- Malik, M. A. (2017). Shadow Education: Evolution, Flaws, and Further Development of the Term. *Social Sciences and Education Research Review*, 4(1), 6-29.
- Mardianto, M. F. F., Kartiko, S. H., & Utami, H. (2019). Prediction the Number of Students in Indonesia who Study in Tutoring Agency and Their Motivations Based on Fourier Series Estimator and Structural Equation Modelling. *International Journal of Innovation, Creativity and Change*, 5(3), 708-731.



- Margono, S. A., Suharyanto, Krisnajaya, I. M., Subarsono, & Sunaryo, B. (2014). *Fenomena Pengelolaan 'Publicness' Melalui Organisasi Non-Publik*. Gava Media.
- Matsuoka, R. (2018). Inequality in Shadow Education Participation in an Egalitarian Compulsory Education System. *Comparative Education Review*, 62(4), 565-586.
- Mori, I., & Baker, D. (2010). The Origin of Universal Shadow Education: What the Supplemental Education Phenomenon Tells Us About the Postmodern Institution of Education. *Asia Pacific Education Review*, 11(1), 36-48.
- Oller, A. C., & Glasman, D. (2013). *Education as A Market in France: Forms and Stakes of Private Tutoring*. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill.
- Pallegedara, A. (2011). *Demand for Private Tuition Classes Under the Free Education Policy: Evidence Based on Sri Lanka*. Munich: Munich Personal Repec Archive.
- Pallegedara, A. (2012). Demand for Private Tutoring in A Free Education Country: The Case of Sri Lanka. *International Journal of Education Economics and Development*, 3(4), 375-393.
- Panda, N., & Behera, L. (2021). Learning Opportunities during School Closure: Exploring Prevalence of Shadow Education. *Pedagogy of Learning*, 7(3), 36-47.
- Park, H., Byun, S. Y., & Kim, K. K. (2011). Parental Involvement and Students' Cognitive Outcomes in Korea: Focusing on Private Tutoring. *Sociology of Education*, 84(1), 3-22.
- Park, H. (2013). *Re-Evaluating Education in Japan and Korea: De-Mystifying Stereotypes*. Routledge.
- Park, H., Buchmann, C., Choi, J., & Merry, J. J. (2016). Learning Beyond the School Walls: Trends and Implications. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 42, 231-252.
- Pesch, U. (2005). *The Predicaments of Publicness: An Inquiry into the Conceptual Ambiguity of Public Administration*. Delft, the Netherlands: Eburon.
- Pesch, U. (2008). The Publicness of Public Administration. *Administration & Society*, 40(2), 170-193.
- Popa, S. (2007). *Defensible Spaces: Ideologies of Professionalism and Teachers' Work in The Romanian Private Tutoring System* (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). Pittsburgh, PA: University of Pittsburg.
- Prasaad, B. D. (2008). *Content Analysis: A Method of Social Science Research*. In D. d. Lal Das (ed), *Research methods for Social Work*. New Delhi: Rawat.

- Reza, I. F. (2016). Redefinisi *Publicness* dalam Ruang Lingkup Administrasi Publik di Indonesia. *Natapraja*, 4(2).
- Rutgers, M. R. (2003). Tracing the Idea of Public Administration: Towards a Renaissance of Public Administration. *Retracing Public Administration*, 1-36.
- Safarzyńska, K. (2013). Socio-Economic Determinants of Demand for Private Tutoring. *European Sociological Review*, 29(2), 139–154.
- Schreier, M. (2013). *Qualitative Content Analysis in Practice*. London: SAGE Publications.
- Silova, I., Būdienė, V., & Bray, M. (Eds.). (2006). *Education in Hidden Marketplace: Monitoring of Private Tutoring*. New York: Open Society Institute.
- Silova, I. (2009). *Private Supplementary Tutoring in Central Asia: New Opportunities and Burdens*. Paris: UNESCO International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP).
- Smyth, E. (2009). Buying Your Way into College? Private Tuition and the Transition to Higher Education in Ireland. *Oxford Review of Education*, 35(1), 1-22.
- Stake, R. (1995). *The Art of Case Study Research*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Stake, R. E. (2005). *Qualitative Case Studies*. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *the SAGE Handbook of Qualitative Research* (Third Edition, pp. 443–466). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Stevenson, D. L., & Baker, D. P. (1992). Shadow Education and Allocation in Formal Schooling: Transition to University in Japan. *American Journal of Sociology*, 97(6), 1639–1657.
- Tan, J. (2009). Private Tutoring in Singapore: Bursting Out of the Shadows. *Journal of Youth Studies (Hong Kong)*, 12(1), 93–103.
- Waldo, D. (1968). *Scope of the Theory of Public Administration*.
- Yin, R. K. (2009). *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. Fourth Edition. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.
- Zhang, Y. (2011). The Determinants of National College Entrance Exam Performance in China with an Analysis of Private Tutoring (Doctoral Dissertation, Columbia University).
- Zhang, W. (2013). Private Supplementary Tutoring Received by Grade 9 Students in Chongqing, China: Determinants of Demand, and Policy Implications (Doctoral Dissertation). Hong Kong: The University of Hong Kong.
- Zhang, W. (2021). Modes and Trajectories of Shadow Education in Denmark and China: Fieldwork Reflections by A Comparativist. *ECNU Review of Education*, 4(3), 615-629.





UNIVERSITAS  
GADJAH MADA

**Dimensi Kepublikan (Publicness) dari Bimbingan Belajar Bebas Biaya (Fee-Free Tutoring): Studi Kasus**

**Bimbingan Belajar oleh Ambis Bareng**

JIHAN ZHARIFAH, Puguh Prasetya Utomo, S.I.P., M.P.A., Ph.D.

Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2024 | Diunduh dari <http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/>

Zhang, W., & Bray, M. (2020). Comparative Research on Shadow Education: Achievements, Challenges, and the Agenda Ahead. *European Journal of Education*, 55(3), 322–341.