UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
REVEALING THE ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF RAILWAY INVESTMENTS (A Cost Benefit Analysis for Assessing
Demand and Travel Time Savings in pursuit of acceptable Benefit Cost Ratio Value)
Zulhazmi Alfian Nur, Prof. Dr.Eng. Ir. Muhammad Zudhy Irawan, S.T., M.T. ; Dr.Eng. Ir. Imam Muthohar, S.T., M.T, IP
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2024 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

TABLE OF CONTENTS

APPROVAL SHEET III
ACKNOWLEDGMENT SHEET IV
DECLARATION OF ACADEMIC INTEGRITY V
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS VI
PREFACE VII
TABLE OF CONTENTS VIII
LIST OF TABLES X
LIST OF FIGURES XI
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS XII
ABSTRACT XIII
INTISARI XIV

CHAPTER 1 INTRODUCTION 1
1.1. Background Research 1
1.2. Problem Statement 3
1.3. Aim of the Research 3
1.4. Research Scope 4

CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW 6
2.1. Good Old Transport Appraisal Studies 6
2.2. Recent Transport Appraisal studies 6
2.3. Originality of the Study 7

CHAPTER 3 THEORITICAL BASIS 9
3.1. Introducing to Transport Appraisal 9
3.2. Cost Benefit Analysis 11
3.3. Total Benefit 13
3.3.1. User Benefit 14
3.3.2. Generalised Journey Cost (GJC) 16
3.3.3. Diversion Factor 18
3.3.4. Marginal External Benefit (MEb) 19
3.4. Total Cost 21
3.5. Present Value 22
3.6. Sensitivity analysis 23
3.7. Uncertainties 25
3.7.1. Capital Cost 25
3.7.2. Diversion Factor 26
3.7.3. Economic Growth 26
3.8. Developing the CBA model 27
3.8.1. Diversion Factor 27
3.8.2. Total benefit 28
3.8.3. Total Cost Equation 30
3.8.4. CBA model 31
3.8.5. Comparison of current and improved appraisal approaches 32

CHAPTER 4 METHODOLOGY 34
4.1. Case Selection 34

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
REVEALING THE ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF RAILWAY INVESTMENTS (A Cost Benefit Analysis for Assessing
Demand and Travel Time Savings in pursuit of acceptable Benefit Cost Ratio Value)
Zulhazmi Alfian Nur, Prof. Dr.Eng. Ir. Muhammad Zudhy Irawan, S.T., M.T. ; Dr.Eng. Ir. Imam Muthohar, S.T., M.T, IP
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2024 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

4.2. Methodological Approach 34
4.3. Research Procedures 35
4.4. Data and Tools 37
4.4.1. Tools 37
4.4.2. Data 38
4.4.3. Capital cost 38
4.4.4. Fares and Operational Cost 39
4.4.5. Expected Travel Time Saving 40
4.4.6. Value of Travel Time 41
4.5. Research parameters 41

CHAPTER 5 ANALYSIS 43
5.1. Testing the CBA model 43
5.1.1. Barrow Hill Line 43
5.1.2. Fleetwood 44
5.1.3. Discussion 45
5.2. Sensitivity Analysis on Key Determinant 46
5.2.1. Baseline Scenario 47
5.2.2. Capital cost for BCR 1.5 48
5.2.3. Operational Cost for BCR 1.5 50
5.2.4. Diversion Factor for BCR 1.5 51
5.2.5. Discount Rates for BCR 1.5 52
5.2.6. Low, Medium and High Value for Money 53
5.2.7. Summarize 55
5.2.8. Global Sensitivity Test 57
5.3. Relevance for Implementation in Indonesia 59
5.3.1. Comparison with Indonesian approach 59
5.3.2. Adjustments needed for Indonesian implementation 63

CHAPTER 6 CONCLUSION 66
6.1. Conclusion 66
6.2. Policy Implication 68
6.3. Future Research 69

REFERENCES 70

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
**REVEALING THE ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF RAILWAY INVESTMENTS (A Cost Benefit Analysis for Assessing
Demand and Travel Time Savings in pursuit of acceptable Benefit Cost Ratio Value)**
Zulhazmi Alfian Nur, Prof. Dr.Eng. Ir. Muhammad Zudhy Irawan, S.T., M.T. ; Dr.Eng. Ir. Imam Muthohar, S.T., M.T, IP
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2024 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Summary of Previous Study and literature 8
Table 3.1 Value for Money Categories 12
Table 3.2 Value of Time 16
Table 3.3 Quality-adjusted VOT 17
Table 3.4 Diversion Factor 19
Table 3.5 Monetary Cost of Externalities 21
Table 3.6 Diversion factor. Modified from 28
Table 4.1 Various levels of capital cost 39
Table 4.2 Capital cost per KM without optimism bias 39
Table 4.3 Railway incomes Revenue 2017 – 2019 40
Table 4.4 Various levels of operational cost 40
Table 5.1 Key determinant from Barrowhill Line BC 44
Table 5.2 Appraisal Comparison on Barrow Hill Line 44
Table 5.3 Key determinant Fleetwood BC 45
Table 5.4 Appraisal Comparison of Fleetwood line 45
Table 5.5 Baseline Scenario 47
Table 5.6 Demands threshold for BCR at least 1.5 49
Table 5.7 Demand required for various level of Operational Cost 51
Table 5.8 Demand required for BCR 1.5 in different diversion factor 52
Table 5.9 Demand required for BCR 1.5 in different discount rates 53
Table 5.10 Demand required based on various circumstances 54
Table 5.11 Summarize of all OAT sensitivity test 56
Table 5.12 Global Sensitivity Test Indices 58
Table 5.13 VoT approach comparison between UK and Indonesia 60
Table 5.14 MEb approach comparison between UK and Indonesia 61

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
**REVEALING THE ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF RAILWAY INVESTMENTS (A Cost Benefit Analysis for Assessing
Demand and Travel Time Savings in pursuit of acceptable Benefit Cost Ratio Value)**
Zulhazmi Alfian Nur, Prof. Dr.Eng. Ir. Muhammad Zudhy Irawan, S.T., M.T. ; Dr.Eng. Ir. Imam Muthohar, S.T., M.T, IP
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2024 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 3.1 Consumer Surplus in Existing Modes Scenario 14
Figure 3.2 Consumer Surplus Change in New Modes Scenario 15
Figure 3.3 Externalities graph 20
Figure 4.1 Location of UK and Indonesia 34
Figure 4.2 Research Procedure 37
Figure 5.1 Demand and TTS required in the baseline scenario. 48
Figure 5.2 Demand required for BCR 1.5 in the context of different capital cost 49
Figure 5.3 Demand required for BCR 1.5 in different operational cost 51
Figure 5.4 Present value CFD of BCR 1.5 under the most optimistic scenario 55
Figure 5.5 Cumulative Nett Present CFD 55

UNIVERSITAS
GADJAH MADA
REVEALING THE ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF RAILWAY INVESTMENTS (A Cost Benefit Analysis for Assessing
Demand and Travel Time Savings in pursuit of acceptable Benefit Cost Ratio Value)
Zulhazmi Alfian Nur, Prof. Dr.Eng. Ir. Muhammad Zudhy Irawan, S.T., M.T. ; Dr.Eng. Ir. Imam Muthohar, S.T., M.T, IP
Universitas Gadjah Mada, 2024 | Diunduh dari http://etd.repository.ugm.ac.id/

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

BCR	Benefit Cost Ratio
CAPEX	Capital Expense
CBA	Cost Benefit Analysis
DT	Double Track
MCA	Multi Criteria Analysis
GHG	Green House Gasses
GJC	Generalized Journey Cost
GJT	Generalized Journey Time
GSA	Global Sensitivity Analysis
GVA	Gross Value Added
IVT	In Vehicle Time
LSA	Local Sensitivity Analysis
OPEX	Operating Expense
RDS	Real Demand Survey
RYR	Restoring Your Railway
SOBC	Strategic Outline Bussines Case
ST	Single Track
TAG	Transport Appraisal Guidance
UK	United Kingdom
VOC	Vehicle Operating Cost
VOT	Value of Travel Time
VTTS	Value of Travel Time Saving
WEI	Wider Economic Impacts
1 GBP	Rp 19,182.00